



**Notice of meeting of  
Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee**

**To:** Councillors Riches (Chair), Watt (Vice-Chair), Burton, Levene, Semlyen, Williams, Hyman and D'Agorne

**Date:** Tuesday, 15 November 2011

**Time:** 2.30 pm

**Venue:** The Guildhall, York

**AGENDA**

- 1. Declarations of Interest** (Pages 3 - 4)  
At this point Members are asked to declare any personal or prejudicial interests they may have in the business on this agenda.
- 2. Minutes** (Pages 5 - 10)  
To approve and sign the minutes of the last meeting of the Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee held on 27 September 2011.
- 3. Public Participation**  
It is at this point in the meeting that members of the public who have registered their wish to speak can do so. The deadline for registering is **Monday 14 November 2011 at 5 pm.**

To register please contact the Democracy Officer for the meeting, on the details at the foot of this agenda.

**4. Presentation on Proposed Scrutiny Topic: (Pages 11 - 18)  
Reducing the Carbon Footprint in Privately  
Rented Accommodation (e.g. Heslington,  
Hull Road & Fishergate Wards)**

Officers will give a short presentation on the above proposed scrutiny topic. The Committee are then asked to complete the attached Topic Assessment Form (One Page Strategy) to set out clear aims and objectives for the review. The Topic Assessment Form and the questions asked within it acts as a guideline to help identify issues that need to be considered as part of any review.

**5. Work Plan 2011-12 (Pages 19 - 20)**

Members are asked to consider the Committee's work plan for the municipal year 2011-2012. At the last meeting of the Committee held on 27<sup>th</sup> September 2011 Members expressed a wish to add some additional items to the work plan and these are contained within the minutes of the previous meeting attached to this agenda (items 20 & 23 refer). Members are asked to add these items and any others arising into the work plan.

**6. Urgent Business**

Any other business which the Chair considers urgent under the Local Government Act 1972

**Democracy Officer:**

Name- Judith Betts

Telephone No. – 01904 551078

E-mail- [judith.betts@york.gov.uk](mailto:judith.betts@york.gov.uk)

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democracy Officer responsible for servicing this meeting

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports

## About City of York Council Meetings

### Would you like to speak at this meeting?

If you would, you will need to:

- register by contacting the Democracy Officer (whose name and contact details can be found on the agenda for the meeting) **no later than 5.00 pm** on the last working day before the meeting;
- ensure that what you want to say speak relates to an item of business on the agenda or an issue which the committee has power to consider (speak to the Democracy Officer for advice on this);
- find out about the rules for public speaking from the Democracy Officer.

**A leaflet on public participation is available on the Council's website or from Democratic Services by telephoning York (01904) 551088**

### Further information about what's being discussed at this meeting

All the reports which Members will be considering are available for viewing online on the Council's website. Alternatively, copies of individual reports or the full agenda are available from Democratic Services. Contact the Democracy Officer whose name and contact details are given on the agenda for the meeting. **Please note a small charge may be made for full copies of the agenda requested to cover administration costs.**

### Access Arrangements

We will make every effort to make the meeting accessible to you. The meeting will usually be held in a wheelchair accessible venue with an induction hearing loop. We can provide the agenda or reports in large print, electronically (computer disk or by email), in Braille or on audio tape. Some formats will take longer than others so please give as much notice as possible (at least 48 hours for Braille or audio tape).

If you have any further access requirements such as parking close-by or a sign language interpreter then please let us know. Contact the Democracy Officer whose name and contact details are given on the order of business for the meeting.

Every effort will also be made to make information available in another language, either by providing translated information or an

interpreter providing sufficient advance notice is given. Telephone York (01904) 551550 for this service.

যদি যথেষ্ট আগে থেকে জানানো হয় তাহলে অন্য কোন অর্ধাতে তথ্য জানানোর জন্য সব ধরণের চেষ্টা করা হবে, এর জন্য দরকার হলে তথ্য অনুবাদ করে দেয়া হবে অথবা একজন দোস্তবী সরবরাহ করা হবে। টেলিফোন নম্বর (01904) 551 550।

*Yeteri kadar önceden haber verilmesi koşuluyla, bilgilerin terümesini hazırlatmak ya da bir tercüman bulmak için mümkün olan herşey yapılacaktır. Tel: (01904) 551 550*

我們竭力使提供的資訊備有不同語言版本，在有充足時間提前通知的情況下會安排筆譯或口譯服務。電話 (01904) 551 550。

اگر مناسب وقت سے اطلاع دی جاتی ہے تو ہم معلومات کا ترجمہ میا کرنے کی پوری کوشش کریں گے۔ ٹیلی فون (01904) 551 550

*Informacja może być dostępna w tłumaczeniu, jeśli dostaniemy zapotrzebowanie z wystarczającym wyprzedzeniem. Tel: (01904) 551 550*

## **Holding the Cabinet to Account**

The majority of councillors are not appointed to the Cabinet (39 out of 47). Any 3 non-Cabinet councillors can 'call-in' an item of business from a published Cabinet (or Cabinet Member Decision Session) agenda. The Cabinet will still discuss the 'called in' business on the published date and will set out its views for consideration by a specially convened Scrutiny Management Committee (SMC). That SMC meeting will then make its recommendations to the next scheduled Cabinet meeting in the following week, where a final decision on the 'called-in' business will be made.

## **Scrutiny Committees**

The purpose of all scrutiny and ad-hoc scrutiny committees appointed by the Council is to:

- Monitor the performance and effectiveness of services;
- Review existing policies and assist in the development of new ones, as necessary; and
- Monitor best value continuous service improvement plans

## **Who Gets Agenda and Reports for our Meetings?**

- Councillors get copies of all agenda and reports for the committees to which they are appointed by the Council;
- Relevant Council Officers get copies of relevant agenda and reports for the committees which they report to;
- Public libraries get copies of **all** public agenda/reports.

## **MEETING OF ECONOMIC AND CITY DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

### **Agenda item 1: Declarations of interest**

The following Members declared standing personal interests.

Councillor D'Agorne- Employee of York College

This page is intentionally left blank

City of York Council

Committee Minutes

---

MEETING	ECONOMIC & CITY DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
DATE	27 SEPTEMBER 2011
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS BURTON, SEMLYEN, WILLIAMS (IN THE CHAIR), MCILVEEN (SUBSTITUTE FOR COUNCILLOR LEVENE), HYMAN, STEWARD (SUBSTITUTE FOR COUNCILLOR WATT) AND D'AGORNE
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLORS LEVENE, RICHES AND WATT

---

**15. ELECTION OF CHAIR**

At this point in the meeting, due to the absence of both the Chair and Vice Chair, Members elected Councillor Williams to Chair the meeting.

**16. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

At this point in the meeting, Members were asked to declare any personal or prejudicial interests, other than the standing declarations, that they may have in the business on the agenda.

Councillor Semlyen declared a prejudicial interest in agenda item 7 as she is the landlady of two properties in Fishergate and Hull Road Ward.

**17. MINUTES**

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the Economic and City Development Overview and Scrutiny Committee held on 12 July 2011 be agreed as a correct record.

**18. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

**19. UPDATE ON LOCAL ENTERPRISE PARTNERSHIPS (LEPS)**

Members considered a report which provided an update on Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPs), progress made and the approach taken to the setting of priorities. The report also provided some background information on the York and North Yorkshire LEP prior to a presentation being given by the Chief Operating Officer at the York & North Yorkshire LEP on progress and potential benefits to the York economy.

The presentation highlighted the following:

- Overview of the LEP
- Priorities of the LEP
- Benefits to York.

Some Members queried the closure of Business Link in November 2011 and the impact this would have on small businesses in York. They were advised that a clear aim of the LEP is to ensure that small businesses can continue to receive any support they may require.

Members had a discussion regarding the cost implications and benefits to York of staying in the LEP. Members felt that it was too soon to see any clear benefits or otherwise to enable them to comment on the future membership of the York & North Yorkshire LEP. The Committee requested a further progress report in six months time, to also include an update about the work of the Leeds City Region LEP .

- RESOLVED:
- (i) That the report be noted.
  - (ii) That a report on the progress associated with Leeds City Region and the York/North Yorkshire LEP be brought to the Overview and Scrutiny Committee in six months.<sup>1</sup>
  - (iii) That Members recommended that York should remain a Member of the York/North Yorkshire LEP as it is too



early to see any advantages or disadvantages of being a Member.

REASON: The report provided the basis of meeting an earlier Overview and Scrutiny Committee request to keep up to date with LEP progress and to have an opportunity to comment prior to a decision on the City of York Council's membership of the York/North Yorkshire LEP.

Action Required

1. Scrutiny Officer to liaise with LEP TW Representatives to produce report.

**20. 2011/12 FINANCE AND PERFORMANCE MONITOR 1 REPORT**

Members considered a report which provided details of the 2011/12 forecast outturn position for both finance and performance in City Strategy and Housing Services.

Officers outlined the report and Members queried the following:

- The redundancy costs mentioned in paragraph 12, in particular how predictable such costs are. Officers advised that costs are not always predictable as the redundancy process can take longer than anticipated in many cases.
- The savings target mentioned in paragraph 13 of the report relating to Facilities Management. Members commented that reaching the target was highly unlikely and queried why the target had been set in the first place. Officers advised that the target was an estimate set by external consultants. Members asked that an update on the Facilities Management Review and the use of consultants in the budget process setting be brought to a future meeting.
- The high costs associated with the repairs and maintenance at travellers' sites. Officers agreed to email further details to the Committee.

- RESOLVED:
- (i) That the report be noted.
  - (ii) That Officers send an email to Members further details regarding travellers site costs.<sup>1</sup>
  - (iii) That a report be brought to a future meeting to provide an update and further information on the Facilities Management Review and use of consultants in the budget setting process.<sup>2</sup>

REASON: To update and keep the Committee informed of the latest finance and performance position.

Action Required

1. Forward this information to Scrutiny Officer to PL circulate. TW
2. Scrutiny Officer to liaise with Officers to produce report.

**21. REPORT FROM THE CABINET MEMBER FOR CITY STRATEGY ON THE YEAR AHEAD**

Members received a written report from the Cabinet Member for City Strategy on his priorities for the year ahead.

The Cabinet Member outlined his priorities in the following areas:

- Getting York Moving
- Jobs, the Economy and Protecting the Environment
- York City Centre
- Air Quality
- Tackling Climate Change.

Discussions took place, particularly around the issue of bus services in York and the issues surrounding foot streets.

The Chair thanked the Cabinet Member for City Strategy for his attendance.

**22. PRESENTATION ON PROPOSED SCRUTINY TOPIC: REDUCING THE CARBON FOOTPRINT IN PRIVATELY RENTED ACCOMMODATION (E.G. HESLINGTON, HULL ROAD & FISHERGATE WARDS)**

Members received a presentation on the proposed scrutiny topic: Reducing the Carbon Footprint in Privately Rented Accommodation (e.g. Heslington, Hull Road and Fishergate Wards).

The Committee were asked to complete a Topic Assessment Form to set out the clear aims and objectives for the review. This was deferred to a future meeting due to only 2 full committee members being present at this point in the meeting. The other members that were present were substitutes.

Members thanked Officers for their presentation.

**RESOLVED:** That the completion of the Topic Assessment form be deferred to a future meeting, to be advised.

**REASON:** To ensure the Committee can have input as a whole.

**23. WORK PLAN 2011-12**

Members considered a report which presented them with the Committee's work plan for the forthcoming year.

Due to only two full committee members being present at this point in the meeting, it was decided that a further meeting would be scheduled to discuss the work plan in more detail.

**RESOLVED:** (i) That the report be noted.  
(ii) That an additional meeting be scheduled into the work plan to consider the deferred items (Scrutiny Topic Assessment Form and further discussion on the work plan) from the meeting on the 27<sup>th</sup> September.<sup>3</sup>

- (iii) That work plan Items resulting from discussions relating to the Finance and Performance Monitor report and LEP Progress Report be considered at the next meeting.

REASON: To keep the Committee's work plan up to date.

Action Required

1. Arrange a follow up meeting.

TW

Councillor Williams, in the Chair  
[The meeting started at 5.40 pm and finished at 7.35 pm].

**SCRUTINY TOPIC ASSESSMENT FORM FOR COUNCILLORS**  
**'ONE PAGE STRATEGY'**

**What is the broad topic area?**

**Reducing the Carbon Footprint in the Privately Rented Sector  
 (Heslington, Hull Road & Fishergate Wards)**

**What is the specific topic area?**

*i.e. what should be included & excluded from the topic? what are the driver behind the topic?*

**Ambitions for the review:**

*i.e. what is the review trying to achieve & why e.g. financial / efficiency savings and/or performance improvements? what will be different as a result of the review?*

-----  
 (For completion by the relevant Overview & Scrutiny Committee)

**Does it have a potential impact on one or more sections of the population?**

Yes  No

**Is it a corporate priority or concern to the council's partners?**

Yes  No

**Will the review add value? and lead to effective outcomes?**

Yes  No

**Will the review duplicate other work?**

Yes  No

**Is it timely, and do we have the resources?**

Yes  No

**If the answer is 'Yes' to all of the above questions, then the Committee may decide to proceed with the review. To decide how best to carry**

**out the review, the Committee will need to agree the following:**

**1) Who and how shall we consult?**

*i.e. who do we need to consult and why? is there already any feedback from customers and/or other consultation groups that we need to take account of?*

**2) Do we need any experts/specialists? (internal/external)**

*i.e. is the review dependent on specific teams, departments or external bodies? What impact will the review have on the work of any of these?*

**3) What other help do we need? E.g. training/development/resources**

*i.e. does this review relate to any other ongoing projects or depend on them for anything?*

*what information do we need and who will provide it? what do we need to undertake this review e.g. specific resources, events, meetings etc?*

**4) How long should it take?**

*i.e. does the timings of completion of the review need to coincide with any other ongoing or planned work*

## **Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee**

**Tue 27 Sept 2011**

### **Item 7 – Reducing the Carbon Footprint in Privately Rented Accommodation (Heslington, Hull Rd. And Fishergate wards)**

What is a Carbon Footprint ?

Total amount of CO2 emissions which result directly and indirectly from the individual use of goods and services. It is measured in tonnes of CO2 per person per year.

The average UK resident has a carbon footprint of 12.12 t of CO2

The carbon footprint of the average York resident is 12.58 tonnes per year

*From The Carbon Footprint of York report by SEI 2009*

- Households in Dringhouses Central in the ward of Dringhouses and Woodthorpe on average have the highest carbon footprint in York followed by Bishophill (Micklegate), Heworth Without (Heworth Without) , Wheldrake North East (Wheldrake) and Bishopthorpe North (Bishopthorpe).
- Households in Heslington on average have the lowest carbon footprint in York followed by Clifton North West (Clifton), Tang Hall (Hull Road), Westfield North West and Westfield Central (Westfield)
- Neighbourhoods with the highest carbon footprint tend to be in the city centre or in rural and commuter areas.
- Neighbourhoods with the lowest carbon footprint tend to the poorer areas of the city or those areas with a high concentration of students.
- Housing and Transport make up 60% of York's carbon footprint.
- Hull Road South East (Hull Road), Osbaldwick Rural and Osbaldwick (Osbaldwick) have the highest housing footprint.
- Fulford (Fulford), Heslington (Heslington) and Wheldrake Rural (Wheldrake) have the lowest housing footprint.

- ❑ Households in Osbaldwick, Osbaldwick Rural (Osbaldwick), Stockton on the Forest (Strensall), Heworth (Heworth) and the Hull Road (Hull Road) use more energy than other households in York.
- ❑ Households in Dringhouses Central (Dringhouses and Woodthorpe) have the highest transport carbon footprint.
- ❑ Residents in the neighbourhoods of York not only have diverse carbon footprints but also different attitudes to green issues.
- ❑ By scoring attitudes on a scale of one to ten it possible to provide each neighbourhood with an overall numerical value that reflects the level of 'greenness'. A score close to ten indicates strong greenness and close to one, weak greenness.
- ❑ Households in the Groves (Guildhall), Clifton Hospital Area (Clifton), Heslington (Heslington), Nicholas Fields (Hull Road) and Fishergate West (Fishergate) have a strong level of green attitudes
- ❑ Households in Westfield Central (Westfield), Clifton North West (Clifton), Westfield North West, Westfield East (Westfield) and Tang Hall (Hull Road) have a weak level of green attitudes.
- ❑ There is a tendency for those neighbourhoods which have a strong level of green attitudes to also have large carbon footprint.
- ❑ Heslington (Heslington) is the only neighbourhood which has both a strong level of green attitudes and a low carbon footprint.
- ❑ Households which have the highest potential for behavioural change are those which have a large carbon footprint, strong level of green attitudes and local infrastructure that makes green actions easy.
- ❑ The study recommended a targeted campaign should be conducted to encourage those neighbourhoods which have the highest potential for behavioural change to adopt greener lifestyles – to provide an effective way to achieve a reduction in overall household CO<sub>2</sub> emission in York.
- ❑ The York Green Neighbourhood Challenge tested this approach..

Success – reduction of carbon footprints by 11.5%

Now rolled out to Fulford area and hopefully Copmanthorpe with Ward Committee support.



**Reduce Carbon footprint in privately rented sector (e.g. Heslington, Hull Road, Fishergate)"**

**Housing – what have we been doing ?**

General

**Private Sector Stock Condition Survey 2008:** Provides the evidence base, specific issues found were:

- that the private rented sector was worse than other tenures and
- certain wards were less energy efficient and
- had higher incidence of fuel poverty ( Hull Road and Fishergate)

Action

Work closely with the York Energy Partnership to deliver measures and independent free impartial advice.

Measures

**Range of Grants:** Historically have provided a range of grants for the private sector (homeowners and private rented sector) through the Yorkshire Energy Partnership to improve energy efficiency.

1593 number of grants provided (loft and/or cavity wall insulation and in some limited cases) – since 2006 to the private sector including homeowners.

Specific to Private rented sector

86 Affordable Warmth grants were provided

5 in Fishergate

33 in Hull Road Ward

1 in Heslington

Specific to the three areas

**Area based Approach:** All residents in the Fishergate and Hull Road Ward were offered free loft and cavity wall insulation to improve the energy efficiency and impartial advice. Approximately 20% uptake.

253 households benefitted from loft and/or cavity wall insulation in Fishergate.

242 households benefitted from loft and/or cavity wall insulation in Hull Road Ward.

Funding came from both Regional Housing Board Private Sector Renewal Funding and our own capital programme. This funding is no longer available.

**One Community Energy Savings Programme (CESP) eligible area** in the Hull Road Ward – Whole House approach/across tenure. We used the whole approach and fully surveyed private sector homes in the area. We are now drawing down funding for the scheme to install a range of energy efficiency measures/ renewable technology and encouraging behaviour change. (see information sheet).

Some lessons have already been learnt for example which may be useful for future work such as the green deal:

- Occupiers often do not have the technical information to fully take advantage of what is on offer. We have compared information gathered through the completion of Home Energy Check form by the resident and the full survey by technical officer and there are some significant discrepancies.
- Dealing with the “hard to treat” properties – blocks of properties needing external solid wall insulation - need to consider street scene/ conservation issues etc not pepper potting.
- Ensuring that residents consider a hierarchy of measures – free impartial advice key to this
- Tackling behaviour change ( up to 25% of carbon savings) – it won't happen over night there needs to be clear consistent messages being given for a long period of time using different medium.



**Landlord newsletter:** Quarterly newsletter produced which is sent electronically to more than 400 landlord and letting agents – specific items on renewable technology and proposed changes to the legislation. ( see landlord newsletter).

**Landlord conference:** Annual conference – focus on providing helping Landlords and letting agents to use the Energy Performance Certificates and renewable technology.

**Website information:** information provided both for tenants and for landlords on a wide range of issues including energy efficiency.

**Houses in Multiple Occupation Licence Conditions:** All 3 Storey with 5 or more unrelated occupants require a HMO licence by law (approximately 20% of the stock) . As part of the relicensing provisions and the initial HMO Licence provisions the prospective licence holder must provide a copy of the Energy performance certificate. A licence condition can be imposed to ensure that the low cost measures are installed (e.g. loft and cavity wall insulation)

**Code of Practice:** Information provided to help landlords and letting agents of shared student properties to meet both the legal standards and standards which have been determined in partnership as being good practise. The code is renewed annually in partnership with the colleges of further education, statutory stakeholders (North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service/Safer York Partnership ), Student Unions, York Residential Landlord Association and independent Landlords. Information on energy efficiency measures included. Feedback from the group is that students are a group of tenants who are very aware of environmental issues and actively seek out properties which are more energy efficiency using the energy performance certificates. (see Code of practice)

## Other

- Work closely with the other councils of the Leeds City Region on the **Domestic Energy Efficiency Programme** – aim is reduce carbon emissions and tackle fuel poverty through a Whole house approach and behavioural change. Currently focused on CESP and CERT schemes.
- **Training:** City of York Council staff have completed training to be fully qualified domestic energy assessors
- Currently carrying out preliminary work on an Accreditation Scheme for landlords key focus will be on “Green Landlords”.

## Future focus

will be:

1. Completing the CESP area
2. maximising Carbon Emission Reduction Target (CERT) for all residents
3. preparing residents including landlords/letting agents and tenants for the new opportunities Green Deal including Energy Company Obligation (ECO . ) – Awaiting the consultation document, due sometime very soon.
4. Renewable technology
5. Implementing the Energy Act 2011

We know that there are significant challenges ahead and our focus will be to provide members with information.

## Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee Work Plan 2011/2012

Meeting Date	Work Programme
27 <sup>th</sup> Sept 2011	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Update on Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPS) and a presentation from the Chief Operating Officer of the York and North Yorkshire LEP</li> <li>2. Quarterly Financial &amp; Performance Monitoring Reports</li> <li>3. Report from the Cabinet Member for City Strategy on the year ahead</li> <li>4. Presentation on Proposed Scrutiny Topic: Reducing the Carbon Footprint in the Privately Rented Sector (e.g. Heslington, Hull Road &amp; Fishergate)</li> <li>5. Workplan</li> </ol>
13 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2011	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Quarterly Financial &amp; Performance Monitoring Reports</li> <li>2. Update on the implementation of recommendations arising from the Water End Councillor Call for Action</li> <li>3. Workplan</li> </ol>
24 Jan 2012	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Report from the Cabinet Member for Health, Housing &amp; Adult Social Services) (Housing aspect of the portfolio)</li> <li>2. Update on the implementation of recommendations arising from the Newgate market Scrutiny Review</li> <li>3. Six Monthly Update Report on Major Developments within the City of York Council</li> <li>4. Six Monthly Update Report on Major Transport Initiatives &amp; Issues Arising from them</li> <li>5. Workplan</li> </ol>
13 March 2012	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Quarterly Financial &amp; Performance Monitoring Reports</li> <li>2. Update on Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPS)</li> <li>3. Workplan</li> </ol>

This page is intentionally left blank